



September 25, 2019

To: Scott Smithline, Director CalRecycle  
cc: Bob Peoples, CARE Executive Director

From: California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee (members listed below)

**Re: Advisory Committee Comments regarding CARE's Chapter 0 Report**

The California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee ("Advisory Committee") has reviewed CARE's *Chapter 0 Report* dated September 1, 2019 which addresses CalRecycle's conditions for approval of its Revised California Carpet Stewardship Plan 2018-2022. This review is outside the statutory requirements of the Product Stewardship for Carpets Law (Public Resources Code Section 42970 - 42983), therefore the recommendations provided in this document by the Advisory Committee are stakeholder comments and do not require an official response by CARE.

**California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee Members**

The Product Stewardship for Carpets Law (Public Resources Code Section 42970 - 42983), requires CalRecycle to appoint an Advisory Committee to provide recommendations to a carpet manufacturer or stewardship organization and to the department on carpet stewardship plans, plan amendments, and annual reports. An additional appointee to the Advisory Committee is also made by both the Senate Committee on Rules and the Speaker of the Assembly.

The Director of CalRecycle appointed the members to the California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee according to the general stakeholder categories recommended in the statute. The committee member from the Senate Committee on Rules and the Speaker of the Assembly have also been appointed.

The California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee members, along with their organizations and stakeholder representation are listed below.

## California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee Members

<b>Committee Members</b>	<b>Organizations</b>	<b>Representing</b>
<b>DOUGLAS WILLIAMS</b>	<b>Los Angeles Fiber Co./ Reliance Carpet Cushion</b>	<b>Collection and sorting, processing and manufacturing</b>
<b>ERIC NELSON</b>	<b>Interface</b>	<b>Carpet Mills, Collection, processing &amp; recycling</b>
<b>FRANCO ROSSI</b>	<b>Aquafil USA</b>	<b>Processing &amp; recycling of carpet, Manufacturing</b>
<b>GAIL BRICE</b>	<b>XT Green, Inc.</b>	<b>Processing &amp; recycling</b>
<b>HOWARD SAPPER</b>	<b>Carpet Manufacturers Warehouse</b>	<b>Carpet Retailers</b>
<b>JOANNE BRASCH, Ph.D</b>	<b>CA Product Stewardship Council</b>	<b>Environmental Community</b>
<b>JOE YARBROUGH</b>	<b>The Carpet &amp; Rug Institute</b>	<b>Carpet Mills</b>
<b>JOHN DAVIS</b>	<b>Mojave Desert &amp; Mountain Recycling Integrated Waste Mgmt Joint Powers Authority</b>	<b>Local Government</b>
<b>JORGE OROZCO</b>	<b>SCOR Industries</b>	<b>Speaker of Assembly</b>
<b>NAT ISAAC</b>	<b>City of Los Angeles Environment and Sanitation</b>	<b>Local Government</b>
<b>RACHEL PALOPOLI</b>	<b>Planet Recycling</b>	<b>Carpet Collections/Sorting</b>
<b>ROBERT NUNEZ</b>	<b>Californians Against Waste</b>	<b>Environmental Community</b>
<b>STEVE BELONG</b>	<b>Carpet, Linoleum, &amp; Soft Tile Workers Local Union No. 12, District Council 16</b>	<b>Northern CA Floor Covering Finishing Trades Institute Joint Apprenticeship Training Committee</b>
<b>STEVE LANDRETH</b>	<b>ProSpectra Flooring</b>	<b>Senate Committee on Rules</b>
<b>WES NELSON</b>	<b>GreenWaste Carpet Recycling</b>	<b>Carpet Collections/Sorting</b>

### Advisory Committee Plan Review Meeting and Recommendations

The California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee met through a teleconference on September 20, 2019 to discuss CARE's *Chapter 0 Report* dated September 1, 2019 which addresses CalRecycle's conditions for approval of its Revised California Carpet Stewardship Plan 2018-2022.

Eleven committee members attended the full meeting. Joe Yarbrough attended the meeting but did not vote due to audio problems. Jorge Orozco and Steve Belong were not able to attend. Because the meeting went over the scheduled time, Nat Isaac needed to leave for a previously scheduled meeting and did not vote on all motions. A quorum was met. Members of the public also attended through the teleconference. The meeting was conducted in compliance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

The Advisory Committee recommendations from the September 20, 2019 meeting regarding CARE's *Chapter 0 Report* are provided as Attachment 1. The Committee looks forward to working with CARE and CalRecycle regarding the California Carpet Stewardship Program.

**Respectfully,**

*Rachel Palopoli*

**Rachel Palopoli**, Advisory Committee Chair

September 25, 2019

Date

## Attachment 1

### California Carpet Stewardship Advisory Committee Recommendations for the CARE Chapter 0 Report

#### **Motion 1.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that:

- a. Prior to using acronyms in any specific section that the meaning of the acronyms be called out.
- b. The distinction between carpet tile and broadloom be addressed in the Collection Cost Model.
- c. CARE make their Communication Policy public, that is referenced on page 0-7.
- d. CARE provide the modeling team report to the Advisory Committee, that is referenced on page 0-8.
- e. The C&D study report be completed in less than 12 months, that is referenced on page 0-12

Motion to Approve: Eric Nelson    Second: Franco Rossi

Ayes (12): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch, John Davis, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Robert Nunez, Steve Landreth, Wes Nelson

Nays (0):

Abstain (1): Joe Yarbrough

Absent (2): Jorge Orozco, Steve Belong

**The motion passes**

#### **Motion 2.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE reduce redundancies in the reports and add page references for ease of reading.

Motion to Approve: Franco Rossi    Second: Joanne Brasch

Ayes (11): Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch, John Davis, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Robert Nunez, Steve Landreth, Wes Nelson

Nays (1): Doug Williams

Abstain (1): Joe Yarbrough

Absent (2): Jorge Orozco, Steve Belong

**The motion passes**

**Motion 3.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE consider increasing the CSE subsidies in order to meet the recycling goals.

Motion to Approve: Gail Brice    Second: Wes Nelson

Ayes (3): Gail Brice, Joanne Brasch, Wes Nelson

Nays (7): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Howard Sapper, John Davis, Nat Isaac, Steve Landreth

Abstain (3): Joe Yarbrough, Rachel Palopoli, Robert Nunez

Absent (2): Jorge Orozco, Steve Belong

**The motion did not pass**

**Motion 4.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that the regional difference conclusions be reconsidered from the Report until it can be based on statistically valid data, as referenced on page 0-10.

Motion to Approve: Gail Brice    Second: Joanne Brasch

Ayes (7): Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Joanne Brasch, Nat Isaac, Rachel Palopoli, Robert Nunez, Wes Nelson

Nays (4): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Howard Sapper, Steve Landreth

Abstain (2): Joe Yarbrough John Davis

Absent (2): Jorge Orozco, Steve Belong

**The motion passes**

## **Motion 5.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends a timetable for implementation and expected completion dates for the following approaches referenced on pages 0-13 and 0-14:

- a. Develop a proposal and work with mills to ensure that all large volume direct-ship customers (e.g., retailers, flooring contractors, property management companies, etc.), with adequate storage space, have the opportunity for convenient on-site collection of tear-out carpet
- b. Develop a proposal and work with mills to pilot two Distribution Center (DC)/Warehouse locations for their regular retailer/contractor/installer customers to self-haul their tear-out carpet for recycling collection.

The Advisory Committee acknowledges that these are good ideas.

Motion to Approve: Howard Sapper      Second: Wes Nelson

Ayes (10): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch, John Davis, Robert Nunez, Steve Landreth, Wes Nelson

Nays (1): Rachel Palopoli

Abstain (1): Joe Yarbrough

Absent (3): Jorge Orozco, Steve Belong, Nat Isaac

**The motion passes**

## **Motion 6.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE develop criteria with CalRecycle to determine when the costs associated with a specific drop-site greatly exceeds the benefits and alternatives should be explored.

Motion to Approve: Gail Brice      Second: Steve Landreth

Ayes (10): Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch, John Davis, Rachel Palopoli, Robert Nunez, Steve Landreth, Wes Nelson

Nays (1): Doug Williams

Abstain (1): Joe Yarbrough

Absent (3): Jorge Orozco, Steve Belong, Nat Isaac

**The motion passes**

### **Motion 7.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends, in view of the inconclusive results from the independent cost analyses, that CARE use their authority, such as the Member-in-good-standing Agreement, to receive all relevant financial data from all subsidy recipients to properly comply with this task, as referenced on page 0-3.

Motion to Approve: Franco Rossi                      Second: Joanne Brasch

Ayes (11): Doug Williams, Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch, John Davis, Rachel Palopoli, Robert Nunez, Steve Landreth, Wes Nelson

Nays (0):

Abstain (1): Joe Yarbrough

Absent (3): Jorge Orozco, Steve Belong, Nat Isaac

**The motion passes**

### **Motion 8.0**

The Advisory Committee recommends that CARE provide price data comparisons for the projected financial model and subsidy justification model.

Motion to Approve: John Davis    Second: Howard Sapper

Ayes (11): Eric Nelson, Franco Rossi, Gail Brice, Howard Sapper, Joanne Brasch, John Davis, Rachel Palopoli, Robert Nunez, Steve Landreth, Wes Nelson

Nays (1): Doug Williams

Abstain (1): Joe Yarbrough

Absent (2): Jorge Orozco, Steve Belong, Nat Isaac

**The motion passes**